Hazel Roby, as Administratrix of the Estate of Ronald Tyrone Roby, Deceased

Benton Express, Inc.

Exhibit C Plaintiff's Response to **Defendant's Reply Brief**

Excerpts from the Deposition of Robert Tynes

```
1
         IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
 1
         FOR THE MIDDLE DISTRICT OF ALABAMA
 2
                  NORTHERN DIVISION
 3
 4
 5
     HAZEL M. ROBY, as
 6
     Administratrix of the
 7
     Estate of RONALD
     TYRONE ROBY, Deceased,
 9
10
            Plaintiff,
11
12
                                 CIVIL ACTION NO:
13
     v.
                                    2:05CV194-T
14
     BENTON EXPRESS, INC.,
15
16
     et al.,
17
           Defendants.
18
19
20
21
                   DEPOSITION OF:
22
23
                   ROBERT C. TYNES
24
25
```

- 1 A. I just told you.
- 2 Q. Yes?
- A. That I thought that they finally came
- 4 to the realization it was probably futile.
- Q. Okay. Do you know of any technology
- 6 that could have allowed them to locate and
- 7 pinpoint his location and remove him from
- 8 the vehicle if they wanted to?
- 9 A. If they had employed certain
- 10 technologies, then certainly there's
- 11 technologies to locate a truck.
- Q. And what type of technologies is that?
- 13 A. Well, like Qualcomm or something like
- 14 that.
- 15 Q. GPS tracking, not just Qualcomm,
- 16 because Qualcomm is a particular brand?
- 17 A. Yeah, Qualcomm is a brand.
- 18 Q. And what you're talking about is the
- 19 GPS tracking feature of Qualcomm?
- 20 A. Well, you have to have a transmitter
- 21 to go along with the GPS feature. So it
- takes something like Qualcomm. You know,
- 23 like I said, GPS is a series of satellites
- owned by the government. They're not owned
- 25 by Qualcomm.

- 1 O. Right. I'm not trying to get
- 2 technical with you. All I was saying is:
- 3 You are talking about the ability to track
- 4 through the GPS system no matter how it
- 5 works, whether it's a satellite or whatever
- 6 you was explaining to me, but you are
- 7 talking about Qualcomm and other systems
- 8 would allow you to track tractor-trailers?
- 9 A. Yeah, if it's on.
- 10 Q. And some of the trucking companies out
- 11 there on the roads today have the tracking
- 12 feature?
- 13 A. Some of them do, yes.
- Q. And early on, you named quite a few
- 15 for me?
- 16 A. Yeah, there were a few.
- Q. And if they had Qualcomm and the GPS
- 18 tracking feature, just like some of the
- 19 companies you named early on, they could
- 20 have identified and located Craig Stephens?
- 21 A. If it was on and was equipped with it,
- 22 then you could use it to locate him.
- Q. And you keep saying if it's on,
- 24 companies that have GPS tracking features
- 25 through Qualcomm or whatever other service,

- 1 they have the tracking feature. They don't
- 2 just normally turn it off, do they?
- 3 A. Some do.
- 4 Q. If they are trying to track their
- 5 vehicles they do that?
- A. No. It's left to the driver. There's
- 7 certain companies that use it for DOD. If
- 8 they're not hauling DOD explosives, then a
- 9 lot of the drivers want to turn it off and
- 10 they do.
- 11 Q. Let's talk about not hypothetically if
- 12 a driver turns it off. But if you want to
- 13 track your trucks, you don't turn it off, do
- 14 you?
- 15 A. No, not if you want to track them.
- 16 Q. Okay. The companies who are trying to
- 17 track their trucks, they could've located
- 18 Mr. Craig Stephens and found him?
- 19 A. Yes, if it was equipped with Qualcomm
- 20 or some other type of system like that.
- O. Do you know if any companies you are
- 22 aware of have policies and procedures of
- 23 what to specifically if a vehicle comes up
- 24 missing?
- 25 A. I don't know of many.

- 1 the largest insurer of truck carriers?
- A. I don't know that to be true.
- 3 Q. Are they big?
- 4 A. They are a big insurer.
- 5 Q. You do agree and we talked about this
- 6 earlier, without saying necessarily
- 7 communication policy or otherwise, but do
- 8 you agree that all carriers including Benton
- 9 has a duty to implement reasonable safety
- 10 policies and procedures to protect the
- 11 motoring public?
- 12 A. Sure.
- Q. And you agree that they have a duty to
- 14 enforce safety policies and procedures to
- make sure drivers are not on the road sleepy
- 16 and fatigued?
- 17 A. Yes, sir, I do.
- Q. And to enforce policies and procedures
- 19 to make sure they are not violating the
- 20 hours of service?
- 21 A. Yes, sir.
- Q. And to have safety policies and
- 23 procedures in place to make sure they are
- 24 not violating any of the Federal Motor
- 25 Carrier Safety Regulations?

- 1 A. There was the 70-hour violations that
- 2 took place back in March.
- Q. Let me be more specific. For this
- 4 trip --
- 5 A. For this trip?
- 6 Q. -- that ultimately led to this wreck?
- 7 A. No, sir.
- 8 Q. So would it be fair to say that as an
- 9 enforcement officer, which you used to be;
- 10 correct?
- 11 A. Correct.
- O. And as an expert, why you're here
- 13 today, that if you had been working at a
- 14 weigh station or at a random roadside
- inspection station, there would not have
- 16 been any reason for you to stop and remove
- 17 the Benton truck from being out there or
- 18 take it out of service?
- 19 A. Not that I am aware of.
- 20 O. I know we talked briefly about
- 21 technological advances. Have you looked at
- 22 any documents to try to determine what
- 23 high-tech systems or technological advances
- 24 are used at Benton?
- 25 A. No.

- 1 Q. You would consider GPS a technological
- 2 advance in the trucking industry?
- 3 A. Sure, it is.
- Q. A high-tech system?
- 5 A. I would.
- 6 Q. That was I would?
- 7 A. Yes, sir.
- 8 Q. Are cellular telephones more
- 9 dependable than two-way walkie-talkie
- 10 systems?
- 11 A. I don't know if they're more
- 12 dependable. I have no idea.
- Q. What about the range of coverage?
- A. I think it depends on the supplier and
- 15 the towers near by. I wouldn't have any
- opinions on who's reliable and who's not.
- 17 O. From looking at the files in this
- 18 case, do you have any idea what method, if
- 19 any, Benton had to tell where -- for
- 20 customers if they called to say where's my
- 21 load, did Benton have any mechanism in place
- 22 to tell specifically where a truck was at a
- 23 specific time?
- A. Not on a specific highway at a certain
- 25 time. They would know if the shipment had

- 1 A. Correct. He didn't, no.
- Q. What do you mean "he," you mean Glenn
- 3 Clark hadn't terminated him?
- 4 A. Correct.
- 5 O. You do understand Glenn Clark was the
- one who had the most routine and frequent
- 7 contact with Craig Stephens?
- 8 A. I would imagine he was more so than
- 9 Jones, because he was in Pensacola everyday.
- 10 Q. And do you remember Jones' testimony
- 11 that he may not have even ever seen him
- 12 before?
- 13 A. Seems like I recall something about
- 14 that.
- Q. Do you agree that a company has a duty
- 16 to do what it advertised to its customers,
- 17 to do what it says it's going to do?
- 18 A. A duty?
- 19 Q. Yeah, to do what it promises its
- 20 customers it's going to do.
- 21 A. They have no regulatory duty to do
- 22 that.
- Q. I mean, as a person who's experienced
- 24 in the industry and consults -- I'm not
- 25 talking about regulatory -- but if a company

- 1 promises a customer that it's going to do
- 2 something, should they do it?
- 3 A. I would think so.
- 4 Q. And if a company advertises that it
- 5 has the most current and technological
- 6 advances, should they have it?
- 7 A. Yeah, but that's a pretty broad
- 8 meaning.
- 9 Q. Right. But you don't advocate a
- 10 company in lying to customers about what its
- 11 technological capabilities are, do you?
- 12 A. No. I wouldn't propose that any
- 13 company lie to their customers.
- Q. And you would agree that they have a
- 15 duty, if they say they are going to do
- 16 something, to do it?
- 17 A. Correct.
- Q. Let me show you what I'm going to mark
- 19 as Plaintiff's Exhibit 18. You have looked
- 20 at the police report, I think you told me?
- 21 A. Yes.

22

- 23 (Plaintiff's Exhibit No. 18 was marked
- 24 for identification.)